

Task Force Recommendations		UBC Response	
Category	Recommendation		President's Response
A. Purpose and Charge of UBC			
1	Become competently informed about the University budget, the budget process, and budget policies	UBC agrees - 3-7-2008	Agree
2	Be the oversight body on campus responsible for monitoring the campus budget throughout the year...quarterly reports from the University Budget Office on budgeted revenues and expenditures relative to actuals of agreed upon budget categories	4-18-2008: UBC disagrees as to being "the oversight body", and recommends that the UBC receive periodic budget vs. actual reports from the University Budget Office. The reports should include revenues and expenditures with budget compared to actuals expenditures. The UBC would like to help define those reports.	I agree that the role of the UBC is to help plan for the upcoming year's budget, not to manage current expenditures. That is the responsibility of the administrative leaders. I agree that the UBC should receive regular reports on approximately a quarterly basis. While I agree that you should be consulted on the form of these reports, I prefer that you be able to review the same reports that are prepared for the Vice Presidents and me.
3	Provide timely communication to the Academic Senate, President, University Executive Committee, and the campus community on budget issues, through the internet and other media, as appropriate	UBC agrees - 3-7-2008	Agree
4	Recommend to the President, in accordance with the University Strategic Plan, allocation of unbudgeted funds (including enrollment growth funds) and provide the methodology by which the recommendation be determined	UBC agrees 4-18-2008	I propose that the UBC review a proposal for the annual budget each year from the Vice Presidents and President, regardless of whether we are facing reductions or have new funds to allocate. Then, I would welcome the UBC to highlight areas of agreement and to recommend changes to the proposed plan.

Task Force Recommendations		UBC Response	
Category	Recommendation		President's Response
5	Review the divisions' plans to reduce services when budget reductions are required and report findings to the President and the University Executive Committee	UBC agrees 4-18-2008	I agree in principle. However, I want to carefully respect our contractual obligations and our employees. If the review is general in nature, then we may be able to allow such a review.
6	Advise the President on general budget policy.	4-18-2008: UBC agrees and in addition UBC identifies and advises the President on budget issues.	The primary role of the UBC is to help plan for the upcoming year's budget. Asking the UBC to review current expenditures in detail moves the focus away from planning. Current year activity is the responsibility of the administrative leaders. Division leaders should be accountable for the use of funds allocated to their units, and the current budget policy identifies this responsibility as an important part of the budgetary process.

<i>Task Force Recommendations</i>		<i>UBC Response</i>	
<i>Category</i>	<i>Recommendation</i>		President's Response
B. UBC Composition			
7	<p>The composition of the UBC should be structured as follows: 2 Facilitators</p>	<p>4-18-2008: UBC disagrees and recommends no facilitators. UBC recommends the Provost as Chair and a Vice Chair who acts as Chair in the Provost's absence. The Vice Chair should be elected from among the UBC members and by the UBC members. Also, the Chair should only vote in the case of a tie.</p>	<p>Frequently, the UBC has struggled to complete its critically important charge, given the amount of meeting time available. Facilitators could help the UBC to more efficiently plan and manage meetings. Also, facilitators will not have a stake in the outcome of the deliberations. The UBC will be staffed by the Budget Director who can take responsibility for managing agendas and summarizing results.</p>
8	<p>Members: 3 Faculty, appointed by the Provost in consultation with the Deans Academic Senate Finance Officer Academic Affairs representative Student Affairs representative Administrative Affairs representative University Advancement representative Staff representative selected by Staff Council Associated Students President or designee</p> <p>Advisors: University Budget Director One Budget Analyst from each division</p>	<p>4-18-2008: UBC suggests the following changes: Replace "3 Faculty, appointed by the Provost..." with four (4) faculty, one representative per college and one from librarians, coaches, etc., and each elected campuswide.</p>	<p>First, the UBC is charged to operate in the best interests of the campus, not specific units. Second, the recent WASC review noted that HSU needs to develop a more centralized, decision-making budget process. Third, the election of UBC faculty representatives has not proven successful in the past as documented by the task force. In this case, I struggle with the UBC's proposed incremental changes to the status quo. I believe that the task force suggests a balanced approach that will work better for the UBC, while continuing to honor our shared governance principles.</p>

Task Force Recommendations		UBC Response	
Category	Recommendation		President's Response
9	The composition of the UBC should be based upon its purpose and charge, not on representation from particular divisions and colleges.	4-18-2008: UBC disagrees and notes the importance of two-way communication across the campus.	This is an issue of effectiveness and efficiency. The solution for communication across the campus is to break down silos and get people talking across the spectrum. Continuing current practice may reinforce inter-unit competition.
10	UBC members should participate in a required annual training program in the beginning of the fall semester...	4-18-2008: UBC agrees	Agree. This will require staff time and money to accomplish.
11	Committee members are expected to apply a University-wide perspective to budget oversight and decision-making.	4-18-2008: UBC agrees	Agree
12	Terms of office will be staggered, three-year renewable terms (except the President, Associated Students).	4-18-2008: UBC agrees with the following addition. UBC would add to the parenthetical statement so that it reads, "(except the President, Associated Students, and positions by virtue of their office)"	Agree
13	Staff support for the committee will be provided by the University Budget Director's office, as needed.	4-18-2008: UBC agrees	Agree
14	...Vice Presidents should be removed as members of the UBC.	4-18-2008: UBC agrees	Agree
15	...we strongly recommend that the UBC employ a consensus decision-making process, thus removing the designated title of "voting" or "nonvoting" members.	4-18-2008: UBC disagrees and recommends that votes should be taken.	I agree with the task force that the UBC should be able to reach consensus on issues. In cases where significant differences cannot be resolved, the UBC should document the various perspectives and their rationales for me to consider.
16	...in alignment with the consensus model, we recommend facilitators rather than chairs for the UBC.	4-18-2008: UBC disagrees. Please see number 7 above for additional information.	Please see comments above. I ask the UBC to implement the task force recommendation as an experiment for one year. Then, we can assess the relative success of the experiment and decide what to do next.

Task Force Recommendations		UBC Response	
Category	Recommendation		President's Response
C. Timeline of University Budget Process			
17	In consultation, the UBC, the Budget Office and the President's Executive Committee (including Deans) should reexamine the budget time line that currently exists in the Humboldt State University Budget Review Process.	4-18-2008: UBC disagrees and recommends following the current budget time line.	We should agree on a budget time line that allows us to complete deliberations on a budget for the coming fiscal year within 45 days after the Governor submits his annual budget to the Legislature. If the current time line allows this, then I agree.
18	...UBC to make budget recommendations in the Fall semester preceding the AY under consideration...	4-18-2008: UBC disagrees and recommends following the current budget time line.	See above.
D. Establishing Budget Priorities			
19	Budget priorities must be linked to the university's strategic plan.	4-18-2008: UBC agrees	Agree
20	University-wide goals and priorities should be established by the President in consultation with members of the campus community. Priorities should be established on an annual basis...Budget priorities should be announced by the President at the beginning of the academic year that precedes the next fiscal year.	4-18-2008: UBC agrees and encourages the President to follow the existing policy.	I agree and believe we have been doing s
E. Office of Institutional Research			
21	The campus should establish an Office of Institutional Research (OIR).	4-18-2008: UBC agrees	HSU lacks a number of administrative offices. Institutional research is important for us to make sound decisions based on facts and to help tell our successes. While we have some existing personnel, we will need to expand administrative personnel and reallocate university resources to fully implement the recommendation for a campuswide IR office.

Task Force Recommendations		UBC Response	
Category	Recommendation		President's Response
22	The OIR should conduct an expenditure analysis that compares how HSU apportions its base budget allocation relative to peer campuses both within and outside of the CSU.	4-18-2008: UBC disagrees because this recommendation is too specific to make before an OIR is established.	This is a critical task force recommendation that will help the UBC with budget planning and should not be dismissed simply due to awkward timing. A valid criticism of our budget process is the need for better peer comparisons. If I have a concern, it is that we view such comparisons carefully and recognize the cases where HSU is unique.
F. Trust, Accountability, and Transparency			
23	All units and committees across campus should review and follow the current campus Humboldt State University Budget Review Process.	4-18-2008: UBC agrees	Agree and note that this includes all units
24	...the campus should support a UBC website that includes all reports to the UBC.	3-7-2008: UBC agrees. Provide timely communication to the campus community on budget issues, by way of letters, up-to-date website, and other available media as appropriate.	Agree and note that this will require allocation of resources to accomplish and that this represents a good use of resources.
25	The campus should also publish an annual line-item budget book...	3-7-2008: UBC agrees.	Agree and note that this will require allocation of resources to accomplish and that this represents a good use of resources.
26	The UBC should review prior year budgets and end-of-year balances...at the beginning of the academic year, divisions report to the UBC on outcomes associated with additional allocations received during the prior budget cycle.	3-7-2008: UBC agrees. Also, as an accountability measure, UBC will ask Vice Presidents and President to provide a detailed report on how they spent the augmented funds from the prior year.	Agree in principle. However, I do not want this activity to grow into a time-consuming, detailed review. Discussions must be kept high level, and the focus must remain on using this information for the UBC's primary charge, budget planning.
27	...performance indicators and assessment practices must be developed for all units across campus to initiate a campus culture of institutional effectiveness.	4-18-2008: UBC agrees. Benchmarks across campus represent a good management tool.	Agree

University Budget Committee
Recommend Changes to Budget Review Task Force Report

DRAFT - For Discussion Only

Task Force Recommendations		UBC Response	
Category	Recommendation		President's Response
28	The UBC should present its recommendations directly to the President and the University Executive Committee in a timely manner and in a public forum.	4-18-2008: UBC agrees and recommends carefully following the current budget process.	Agree depending upon the timeline adopted.
29	Previous to announcing budget decisions to the campus community, the President should present his/her budget decisions directly to the University Executive Council and UBC in a timely manner and in a public forum.	4-18-2008: UBC agrees and recommends carefully following the current budget process.	Agree in principle. I want to respect our contract obligations and respect our employees. For example, I want to allow limited discretion in certain cases for us to communicate with an employee impacted by a budget decision and to fulfill our contract obligations shortly before making a public announcement.